

Idaho State Department of Education
Evidence-Based Research Rubric
Continuum of Evidence of Effectiveness

	Most Rigorous (3 points)	Somewhat Rigorous (2 points)	Marginal (1 point)
Theory/ Research Foundation	Does the model explain the theory behind its design, including references to the scientific literature that elucidate why the model improves student achievement?	Does the model state the theory behind its design explaining how the model's components reinforce one another to improve student achievement?	Does the model explain the theory behind its design?
Evaluation-based Evidence of Effectiveness	Have student achievement gains been shown using experimental and control groups created through large-scale random assignment or carefully matched comparison groups? (Please include how groups were chosen/assigned.)	Have student achievement gains been shown using between or within-school comparisons?	Have student achievement gains been shown for a single school?
	Has the model produced educationally significant pre and post intervention student achievement gains as reliably measured using appropriate assessments?	Has the model produced student achievement gains relative to district means or other comparison groups using appropriate assessment instruments?	Has the model produced improvements on other indicators of student performance, e.g. student attendance, graduation rates, or student engagement?
	Is there evidence that student achievement gains have been sustained for three or more years?	Is there evidence that student achievement gains have been sustained for one or two years?	Is there evidence that other indicators of improved student performance have been sustained for one or two years?
	Have the student achievement gains been confirmed through independent, third-party evaluation?	Has the model been evaluated by a state, district, or school evaluation team?	Has the model been evaluated by its developers?
Implementation	Has the model been fully implemented in multiple sites for three or more years?	Has the model been fully implemented in the original site(s) for three or more years?	Has the model been fully implemented in the original pilot site(s) for a minimum of one school year?
	Is documentation available that clearly specifies the necessary implementation requirements, procedures, and program support, including staff development, curriculum, instructional methods, materials, and assessments?	Is documentation available that attempts to describe the implementation requirements of the model including staff development, curriculum, instruction methods, materials, and assessments?	Is documentation available that provides a general description of the program's requirements?
	Has the model been successfully implemented in schools with characteristics similar to the target school: same grade levels, similar size, similar poverty levels, similar student demographics such as racial, ethnic, and language minority composition?	Has the model been successfully implemented in at least one school with characteristics similar to the target school: same grade levels, similar size, similar poverty levels, similar student demographics such as racial, ethnic, and language minority composition?	Is information on grade level, size, student demographics, poverty level, and racial, ethnic and language minority concentration available for the schools where the model has been implemented?
	Has the model been replicated successfully in a wide range of schools and districts, e.g. urban, rural, suburban?	Has the model been replicated in a number of schools or districts representing diverse settings?	Is full replication of the model being initiated in several schools?
Replicability	Have the replication sites have been evaluated, demonstrating significant student achievement gains comparable to those achieved in the pilot site(s)?	Have some replication sites been evaluated, demonstrating positive gains in student achievement?	Are promising initial results available from the replication sites?